


# *City of Brisbane*

## *Planning Commission Agenda Report*

TO: Planning Commission  For the Meeting of 9/8/11

FROM: Tim Tune, Senior Planner, via John Swiecki, Community Development Director

SUBJECT: **STUDY SESSION:** Implementation of Housing Element Programs H.B.3.b, H.B.3.i, H.I.1.b & H.I.1.c, Regarding Parking Requirements

**RECAP:** At the August 25<sup>th</sup> study session, Commissioners expressed support for the previously recommended parking reduction for senior housing complexes, as well as the suggested reduction of the previously recommended guest parking requirement. It was noted that if the parking ordinance changes result in more nonconforming situations, then they can be dealt with on a case-by-case basis by the Planning Commission.

**STAFF ANALYSIS:** The purpose of this study session is to consider the following potential issues--

- Should the parking requirements for other uses be updated at this time?
- What other provisions of the parking ordinance need clarification?

The next study session will address those issues raised by these study session reviews of the ordinance recommended by the Planning Commission in 2004, with an eye toward drafting a revised ordinance to be formally considered at a future public hearing.

**Parking Requirements for Other Uses:** New parking requirements were recommended by the Planning Commission in 2004 for a number of uses that may be found in relation to residential developments, such as meeting facilities and recreation centers (see attached Redline Version of 2004 Recommended Ordinance). Per recommended Section 17.34.020.B.2, the parking required for such ancillary uses would be calculated separately from that for the residential units. The Commission also recommended new standards for other types of public assembly uses that are included with these in the current parking regulations (which were recommended to be identified as cultural facilities, commercial recreation, marina, meeting halls and places of worship, consistent with the current definitions and district regulations). Where possible, the recommended standards were simple "per sq. ft." ratios based upon state and national survey results. Staff suggests that the terminology used in the parking requirements for some of the other types of uses be updated to be consistent with the other portions of the Zoning Ordinance, but a complete update of these requirements is not intended to be included in the draft ordinance.

*Ancillary Meeting Facilities and Related Uses.* Residential condominium complexes typically include ancillary meeting facilities. If these are open to use by non-residents, they have the potential to generate additional demand for parking beyond that capable of being met by required guest parking spaces. Per recommended Section 17.34.020.B.2, the parking requirement for the meeting facilities would be calculated separately from that for the residential units. Under the current Brisbane Municipal Code, such ancillary uses would fall under the parking standard for “churches, lodges, clubs, community centers, chapels, commercial recreation.” That standard is one parking space for each 4 person capacity, but not less than one space for each 15 square feet of the largest meeting hall. Capacity is calculated using the 2010 California Building Code’s “occupant load factor” of 1 occupant per 7 sq. ft. of concentrated-use assembly areas without fixed seats (Table 1004.1.1). This results in a range of 1 space per 15 to 28 sq. ft. of floor area.

Per General Plan Program 56a, the City must review its parking requirements to assess impacts on on-street parking. Unless on-site parking is provided for ancillary uses in multi-unit residential developments, the parking demand will have to be met by on-street parking, which typically is already in short supply. Thus, although this issue was not specifically addressed in the 2007-2014 Housing Element, the Planning Commission has authority in the General Plan to broaden its scope of review of the parking ordinance.

The 1995 Walker Parking Consultants survey of 160 jurisdictions throughout California found that the City of Brisbane’s parking requirements for such public assembly uses are higher than the State average. The most frequent standards used statewide are one parking space per 3 fixed seats, one parking space per 4 fixed seats, and one parking space per 35 sq. ft. of public assembly use. While standards based upon the number of fixed seats may appear to be more specific, the wide variation in such standards indicates less than unanimous agreement upon how they reflect actual parking demand. A “per sq. ft.” standard is typically easier to apply. Tossing out the two extreme examples among the 115 jurisdictions that base their requirement upon floor area, the adjusted average standard based on square footage would be one space per 49.7 sq. ft. of public assembly use. Accordingly, the Planning Commission recommended in 2004 that the City’s parking standard for “meeting halls” (the term currently used in the zoning district regulations) be 1 parking space per 50 sq. ft. of floor area. To make it clear that a conference room in an office building is not considered a “meeting hall” for parking purposes, the recommended ordinance would clarify that such uses not exceeding 750 sq. ft. in area (the point at which the 1997 Uniform Building Code’s Table 10-A’s greater exiting requirements would apply to less-concentrated assembly areas) would be treated as ancillary office space. Per Tables 1004.1 and 1015.1 of the current 2010 California Building Code, that number would now be 735 sq. ft. for “unconcentrated assembly without fixed seats.”

To update the parking standards for the other uses currently listed under the “churches, lodges, clubs, community centers, chapels, commercial recreation” category in BMC Section 17.34.010, the Planning Commission relied upon the American Planning Association’s “Parking Standards,”

which covered a wide variety of land uses, providing a sampling of typical parking requirements from throughout the country. A number of different types of uses are listed in the APA report that would fall under the current BMC parking regulations' category of "churches, lodges, clubs, community centers, chapels, commercial recreation."

Given the vast number of general and specific categories for commercial recreation uses identified by the APA report, the parking standards recommended in 2004 were 4 per lane bowling alleys, 2 per tee for golf courses, 20 per playing field, 1 per 100 sq. ft. of water area for swimming pools, 3 per ball court, 2.5 per batting cage, 2 per shooting ranges, and 2 per horse stall for stables. For commercial recreation uses that do not fall within these categories, 1 space would be required for every 4 fixed seats for spectators, 1 space per each 200 sq. ft. of floor area used for indoor commercial recreation, and 1 space per each 1,000 sq. ft. of site area used for outdoor commercial recreation. Because "marina" is a separate land use category in the district regulations, it would not be included under "commercial recreation" in the parking requirements. The recommended standard for "marinas" was 1 space per 0.75 berths.

For cultural facilities, the jurisdictions included in the APA report used a variety of parking standards, depending upon the type of facility, with the greatest distinctions made for theaters. Most of the jurisdictions included in the APA report used a standard based upon square feet of floor area for cultural facilities excluding theaters. The most frequently cited standard was 1 space per 300 sq. ft., which is the same standard the City of Brisbane uses for office uses. For theaters, the most frequently used standards were based upon number of seats, which would be expected, since of all of these types of uses reviewed, theaters are the most likely to have fixed seats. Of the jurisdictions using per-seat standards, 1 parking space per 4 seats was the most frequently cited, as well as approximately the average of all the per-seat standards listed. The Commission recommended that the requirement for cultural facilities be 1 space per 300 sq. ft. of floor area, except that for theaters, the standard would be 1 space per 4 seats.

For places of worship, the parking requirements varied more than those for meeting halls, according to the APA report. Recognizing that places of worship typically contain multiple rooms of varying intensity of use, about half of the listed jurisdictions specified that their requirements apply only to the largest assembly room of such uses. In addition, while most jurisdictions used seating as the basis for their parking requirements for places of worship, frequently a conversion factor would have to be included to translate a length of pew into a number of seats (ranging from 1 to 2.5 linear ft. of pew per seat). The average standard based upon number of seats was 1 parking space per 5.2 seats. The average standard based upon floor area was 1 parking space per approximately 40 sq. ft. The 2004 recommended ordinance would use the same standard as for meeting halls, 1 space per 50 sq. ft., but would specifically limit it to the largest assembly room. For the remaining square footage of such buildings, the parking standard would be 1 space per 300 sq. ft., the same as used for cultural facilities.